

## FOREIGNIZATION AND DOMESTICATION OF THE CULTURE-SPECIFIC TERMS IN DON ROSA'S COMICS *THE LIFE AND TIMES OF SCROOGE MCDUCK* AND THEIR TRANSLATED EXPRESSIONS IN *KISAH HIDUP PAMAN GOBER*

By: Dimas Andika Ariowibowo  
Yogyakarta State University  
dimas.andika.ariowibowo@gmail.com

### Abstract

The cultural differences lead to the process of translating culture-specific in communication becomes difficult. Foreignization and domestication are two strategies of translation that can be used to translate culture-specific terms. The aims of this research are: 1) to describe the categories of culture-specific terms in Don Rosa's *The Life and Times of Scrooge McDuck*, 2) to describe the translation strategies of foreignization and domestication of culture-specific terms represented in Don Rosa's *The Life and Times of Scrooge McDuck* into *Kisah Hidup Paman Gober*, and 3) to describe the degree of meaning equivalence in the translation of culture-specific terms in Don Rosa's *The Life and Times of Scrooge McDuck* into *Kisah Hidup Paman Gober*.

This research used qualitative approach. The data used for this research were the culture-specific terms in Don Rosa's *The Life and Times of Scrooge McDuck* and their translated expressions in *Kisah Hidup Paman Gober*. The main instrument was the researcher and the second instrument was the data sheet. To gain the trustworthiness of the data, credibility and dependability in triangulation were applied.

There are three findings of this research. First, all culture-specific terms categories, which were geography, history, society, and culture, were found. The highest frequency comes from geography with 138 culture-specific terms out of 270 culture-specific terms. There are 155 culture-specific terms out of 270 culture-specific terms were translated by foreignization strategy. On the other hand, there are 92 culture-specific terms out of 270 culture-specific terms were translated by domestication strategy. There are 23 culture-specific terms out of 270 culture-specific terms were translated by mixed strategy of foreignization and domestication strategy. The foreignization strategy seems to be used more frequently since there are a lot of culture-specific terms of names of region, town, and people. Third, there are 255 culture-specific terms out of 270 culture-specific terms were translated equivalent in meaning. On the other hand, there are 15 culture-specific terms were translated non-equivalent in meaning. In other words, it can be identified that most of the culture-specific terms have been equivalent in meaning

Keywords: culture, terms, foreignization, domestication, meaning equivalence

### INTRODUCTION

Communication plays important roles in life. One of them is to make people interact with others. They communicate with each other to convey messages and ideas and to express their feelings. In the globalization era, the rapid progress of technology makes people find it easy to communicate with others even to communicate with those who are in abroad.

As it becomes easier, communication among people with different nations can occur. At this point, the process of translation is needed to avoid any misunderstanding when they want

to share their messages so that other people can receive the meaning correctly. It makes translation plays an important role in communication. Wilss (in El-Shafey, 2012: 3) defines translation as the process of transferring a text from the source language into the target language by optimizing the comprehension of style, meaning, and message. However, the differences between the source language and the target language become major issues in the process of translation. One of them is culture-specific terms. Nedergaard-Larsen (in Harakka,

2008: 15) called culture-specific terms as the term “culture-bound element”. They describe the term ‘culture-bound element’ is often used to refer to ‘the non-linguistic sphere, to differentiate phenomena or events existing in source language culture. Culture-specific terms make the process of translation become more difficult.

The translator required a strategy in translation in order to handle the issue of culture-specific terms. Two of them are foreignization and domestication. Venuti (in Munday, 2008: 144-145) defines foreignization as “choosing a foreign text and developing a translation method along lines which are excluded by dominant cultural values in the target language” and domestication as “an ethnocentric reduction of the foreign text to target language cultural values”. Foreignization has three categories; they are preservation, addition, and literal translation. On the other hand, domestication has four categories; omission, globalization, localization, and transformation. Another challenge for the translator of the comic is he or she should pay attention to the degree equivalence of the translation of the culture-specific terms in the target text so the readers easily understand the meaning of the story.

Translation is needed in every aspect of everyday life. One of them is entertainment aspect. Comic is one of the entertainment products that use translation. Many comics from around the world are translated and published in Indonesia. One of them is *The Life and Times of Scrooge McDuck* or in Indonesian *Kisah Hidup Paman Gober*. It is about the life of Scrooge McDuck who travels around the world, including Indonesia, to seek fortune for his poor family.

The researcher is interested to identify the category of culture-specific terms and the strategies of translation which are foreignization and domestication because it often occurs in the comic *The Life and Times of Scrooge McDuck* and it is considered as a problematic issue. It is caused by the differences of culture as anything comes from a nation has its own uniqueness. For

further detail, this research also analyzes the degree of meaning equivalence of the translation of the culture-specific terms so the target readers understand the meaning without any misunderstanding.

The objectives of the research are: (1) to describe the categories of culture-specific terms in Don Rosa’s *The Life and Times of Scrooge McDuck*, (2) to describe the translation strategies of foreignization and domestication of culture-specific terms represented in Don Rosa’s *The Life and Times of Scrooge McDuck* into *Kisah Hidup Paman Gober*, and (3) to identify the degree of meaning equivalence in the translation of culture-specific terms in Don Rosa’s *The Life and Times of Scrooge McDuck* into *Kisah Hidup Paman Gober*.

## RESEARCH METHODS

This research is a descriptive qualitative study. Vanderstoep and Johnston (2009: 7) state that the qualitative research produces narrative or descriptions of the phenomena under study. This research describes the culture-specific terms in *The Life and Times of Scrooge McDuck*, the strategies of translation used to translate the culture-specific terms, and the degree of meaning equivalence of translation of the culture-specific terms.

The form of the data of this research are written expression in dialogues containing culture-specific terms in the comics *The Life and Times of Scrooge McDuck* and its translation in Bahasa Indonesia entitled *Kisah Hidup Paman Gober*. The unit of analysis are words and phrases which are translational related to English cultural specific terms into Bahasa Indonesia translated expression. The sources of data are the comics entitled *The Life and Times of Scrooge McDuck* series by Don Rosa and its Indonesian *Kisah Hidup Paman Gober* published Penerbitan Sarana Bobo.

The primary instrument is the researcher himself. He involved in all processes of the research. He read the comics, and analysed it.

The second instrument is the data sheets from the research. The data sheet is needed to record the data and transferred into a table of analysis.

The researcher did three steps to examine the materials. Reading the source text and the target text to gain the data, taking notes of the data related to the study from the source text and the target text based on the need of the research, and categorizing the data based on the requirements in the research. The data analysis started by reading the source text and the target text of the comics and searching the culture-specific terms in the source text, reading the theory of culture-specific terms, foreignization and domestication, and degree of meaning equivalence, categorizing the culture-specific terms based on the theory of Nedergaard-Larsen (in Harakka, 2008: 15), categorizing the strategy of foreignization and domestication used for translating culture-specific terms, categorizing the degree of meaning equivalence of the translation of the culture-specific terms, checking the data by using relevant dictionaries, and putting the data into table.

## FINDINGS AND DISCUSSION

Based on the analysis of Don Rosa's *The Life and Times of Scrooge McDuck* and their translated expressions in *Kisah Hidup Paman Gober*, the researcher found some data related to the categories of culture-specific terms, foreignization and domestication strategies, and the degree of meaning equivalent.

The researcher here is applied theory of culture-specific terms which is proposed by Nedergaard-Larsen. They classified culture-specific terms into four categories; they are geography, history, society, and culture categories. For the strategy of translation, there are two strategies applied in the translation process. Those are foreignization and domestication which has seven sub-categories. three sub-categories belong to foreignization and four categories belong to domestication.

First is the geography category, consisting of geography, meteorology, biology, and cultural geography. An example of CST that belongs to the geography category is presented as follows.

ST: "But in 1753, one Swindle McSue tricked Seafoam with a contract to deliver some **horseradish** to Jamaica...

(*The Life and Times of Scrooge McDuck part A p.11*)

TT: *Tapi pada tahun 1753, seorang penipu, Swindle McSue mengakali kapten Dorus dengan sebuah kontrak untuk mengirim sejumlah lobak ke Jamaika...*

(*Kisah Hidup Paman Gober p. 29*)

According to [www.drugs.com](http://www.drugs.com), *Horseradish* is "a large-leafed, hardy perennial native to eastern Europe and western Asia. It is grown commercially for its thick, fleshy, white roots that have a strong, irritating, and intensely spicy taste". From the explanation, it is clear that *horseradish* belongs to the geography category.

Second is the history category, consisting of buildings, people and events. An example of CST that belongs to the history category is presented as follows.

ST: I think you're right, **T.R.!**

(*The Life and Times of Scrooge McDuck part A p.73*)

TT: *Ya, kurasa begitu, T.R.!*

(*Kisah Hidup Paman Gober p. 90*)

According to [www.biography.com](http://www.biography.com), *T.R* or *Theodore Roosevelt* was a New York governor who became the 26<sup>th</sup> U.S. president. From the definition, it can be clearly seen that castle belongs to the history category.

Third is the society category, consisting of industrial level (economy), social organization, politics, social conditions, and ways of life, customs. An example of CST that belongs to the society category is presented as follows.

ST: **Sheriff!** Arrest the Beagle Boys!

(*The Life and Times of Scrooge McDuck part A p.98*)

TT: ***Sheriff!** Tangkap Gerombolan Siberat!*

(*Kisah Hidup Paman Gober p. 137*)

According to *Oxford Advanced Learner's Dictionary* (1995:1065), *sheriff* is “an elected officer responsible for keeping law and order in a county”. From the explanation, it is clear that *sheriff* belongs to the society category.

Fourth is the culture category, consisting of religion, education, media, and culture, leisure activities. An example of CST that belongs to the culture category is presented as follows.

ST: I bin ta three state fairs, two **rodeos**, an'a picnic but that was the dangdest thang I ever seed!

(*The Life and Times of Scrooge McDuck part A p.53*)

TT: *Aku telah pergi ke banyak pasar malam, dua **rodeo**, dan piknik! Tapi tadi barusan yang paling hebat!*

(*Kisah Hidup Paman Gober p.72*)

According to *Oxford Advanced Learner's Dictionary* (1995: 1018), *rodeo* is “an exhibition or contest in which cowboys show their skill at catching animals with ropes, riding cattle and wild horses, etc”. From the explanation, it is clear that *rodeo* belongs to the culture category.

The translation strategies used in this research are foreignization and domestication translation strategies proposed by Davies (2003: 72-89). The foreignization strategy consists of three strategies: preservation, addition, and literal translation. Meanwhile, the strategy of domestication consists of four strategies: omission, globalization, localization, and transformation. In this research, there are also some CSTs that used the combination between the foreignization and domestication strategies. It is called mixed strategy.

First example is a CST which is translated by the preservation strategy.

ST: Look—some **indian** buffalo hunters!  
(*The Life and Times of Scrooge McDuck part A p.69*)

TT: *Lihat! **Indian** pemburu bison!*

(*Kisah Hidup Paman Gober p. 86*)

According to [www.history.com](http://www.history.com), *Indian* is a group of people who live in America from over 12,000 years ago. They came from Asia through the “land bridge” from what is now called Alaska. The reason why the translator preserved the term *Indian* is probably that the translator realizes that readers already know this fact.

Second example is a CST which is translated by addition strategy.

ST: But—you're an **Apache!** I thought the army sent you all to a reservation in Florida!

(*The Life and times of Scrooge McDuck part C p.54*)

TT: *Tapi.. kamu **suku Indian Apache!** Kupikir tentara mengirim kalian semua ke tempat penampungan di Florida!*

(*Kisah Hidup Paman Gober p.169*)

According to [www.native-american-indian-facts.com](http://www.native-american-indian-facts.com), *Apache* is an Indian tribe living in the southwest desert area of America including Arizona, Texas, New Mexico, and even the northern tip of Mexico. The translator translated the term into target language by adding the phrase *suku Indian* to make the readers of the target language understand that the term is a name of a native American tribe.

Third example is a CST which is translated by literal translation strategy.

ST: We won't be back afloat until **the spring floods!**

(*The Life and Times of Scrooge McDuck part A p.37*)

TT: *Kita tidak bisa kembali sampai **banjir musim semi!***

(*Kisah Hidup Paman Gober p. 56*)

In this example, the translator used the word-for-word translation by translating the term *the spring floods* into *banjir musim semi*.

Fourth example is a CST which is translated by omission strategy.

ST: Shaddup and play **Poker!** I wanna end this game!

(*The Life and Times of Scrooge McDuck part A p.28*)

TT: *Diam dan teruskan mainnya! Aku mau mengakhiri permainan ini!*

(Kisah Hidup Paman Gober p.47)

According to *Oxford Advanced Learner's Dictionary* (1995: 892) *poker* is “a card-game for two or more people in which the players bet on the values of the cards they hold”. The reason why the translator omitted the term *poker* is that probably *poker* is a card-game which requires betting. In Indonesia, betting is not allowed by the government and if someone does it, it is against the law. As most of the target readers are teenagers, the translator decided to omit the term.

Fifth example is a CST which is translated by globalization strategy.

ST: And this is Sir Swampole McDuck, who sealed the castle **dungeons** in 1220...

(*The Life and Times of Scrooge McDuck part A p.19*)

TT: *Dan ini adalah Sir Robin Bebek yang menutup ruang bawah tanah pada tahun 1220...*

(Kisah Hidup Paman Gober p.37)

According to *Oxford Advanced Learner's Dictionary* (1995: 361), *dungeon* is “a dark underground room used as a prison, especially in castle”. From the definition, it is clear that *ruang bawah tanah* is more general than *dungeon*, because based on the definition *dungeon* is a room used as a prison.

Sixth example is a CST which is translated by localization strategy

ST: What say we all seal the bargain with a **sars'parilla**?

(*The Life and Times of Scrooge McDuck part A p.47*)

TT: *Kita tutup perjanjian kita dengan minum soda?*

(Kisah Hidup Paman Gober p. 66)

According to [www.meriam-webster.com](http://www.meriam-webster.com), *sars'parilla* or *sarsaparilla* is “a sweetened carbonated beverage flavoured with sassafras and oil distilled from a European birch. On the other hand, according to [www.academia.edu](http://www.academia.edu), *soda* or *minuman berkarbonasi* is “minuman yang mengandung asam karbonat, dimana asam karbonat tersebut yang menyebabkan minuman memiliki sentuhan khas soda di mulut dan

*perasaan menggigit saat diminum*”. The reason why the translator translates the term *sars'parilla* with *soda* is that probably most readers in Indonesia do not know *sars'parilla*, which is a carbonated beverage. In Indonesia, a carbonated beverage does exist but in different name, which is *soda*.

Seventh example is a CST which is translated by transformation strategy.

ST: The volcanic gases go through my “**combustion** – **amplifying regulator!**”

(*The Life and Times of Scrooge McDuck part C p.31*)

TT: *Gas dari gunung berapi masuk melalui “mesin otomatisasi bikinian ilmuwan Lung!”*

(Kisah Hidup Paman Gober p.100)

In this example, the term *combustion-amplifying regulator*, which is the extend of term *car*, is translated into the abbreviation of the term *mobil*, which is *mesin otomatisasi bikinian ilmuwan Lung*.

This research also found that the translator successfully transferred the meaning of the CSTs, as most of them are equivalent in meaning. However, there are some CSTs, which are not translated into the target language, that is not equivalent in meaning.

First example is a CST which is translated into the target language, which is equivalent in meaning.

ST: Well, I could easily make it run on costly **whale oil**, or even on petroleum!

(*The Life and Times of Scrooge McDuck part C p.32*)

TT: *Aku bisa dengan mudah membuatnya berjalan dengan minyak ikan paus, atau bahkan petroleum!*

(Kisah Hidup Paman Gober p.101)

According to [www.whalefacts.org](http://www.whalefacts.org), *whale oil* is “oil that has been extracted from a whale's lubber through the process of boiling strips or slabs of the whales blubber and extracting the oil that comes out of it”. The term *whale oil* is translated into *minyak ikan paus* in Bahasa Indonesia. Both CSTs refer to

the same kind of oil, so the CST is fully equivalent in meaning.

Second example is a CST which is translated into the target language, which is partly equivalent increased in meaning.

ST: A **Texas longhorn** would make two of this squarehorned critter!

(*The Life and Times of Scrooge McDuck part A p.114*)

TT: *Sapi tanduk panjang Texas lebih kuat daripada kerbau ini!*

(*Kisah Hidup Paman Gober p.153*)

A114-153

According to tshaonline.org, *Texas longhorn* is “a hybrid breed resulting from a random mixing of Spanish *retinto* (criollo) stock and English cattle that Anglo-American frontiersmen brought to Texas from southern and midwestern states in the 1820s and 1830s. One of the characteristics of Texas longhorn is the horns, which can extend to over 1.8m”. In this example, the term is translated into *sapi tanduk panjang Texas* in Bahasa Indonesia. The translator added the term *sapi* to make it easy to understand as it is a kind of *sapi* which only exists in Texas.

Third example is a CST which is translated into the target language, which is partly equivalent decreased in meaning.

ST: You been using the boilers to bake **custard pies** again, Ratchet?!

(*The Life and Times of Scrooge McDuck part A p.50*)

TT: *Kamu biasa menggunakan ruang uap ini untuk membakar kue, Ratchet?!*

(*Kisah Hidup Paman Gober p.69*)

According to getinmybelly.com, *custard pie* is a true southern icon food, which is the custard itself made from a sweet mixture of milk, sugar, and flavorings thickened with eggs. The translator translated the term *custard pie* into *kue* in Bahasa Indonesia by using the generalization translation strategy. *Custard pie* is a kind of *kue* which does not exist in Indonesia. Therefore, the meaning of the CST decreases.

Fourth example is a CST which is translated into the target language which is different in meaning.

ST: How odd! That **jaguar** is of Aztec design, but the stonework is Incan... and the hieroglyphs are Mayan!

(*The Life and Times of Scrooge McDuck part C p.160*)

TT: *Aneh! Macan itu di buat dengan model Aztec, tapi pahatannya dari Inca... dan tulisannya dari Maya!*

(*Kisah Hidup Paman Gober p.347*)

According to *Oxford Advanced Learner's Dictionary* (1995: 636), *jaguar* is “a large member of the cat family with spots on its back that lives in parts of central America”. Meanwhile, according to kbbi.web.id, *macan* is equivalent with *harimau* or in English it is *tiger*. Those terms are different because *jaguar* and *macan* are different.

Fifth is a CST which is translated into the target language, which has no meaning.

ST: A padre in **Cuzco** these came from a lost valley in the Andes where square poultry is raised by li'l square people!

(*The Life and Times of Scrooge McDuck part A p.60*)

TT: *Kutemukan 19 tahun lalu di lembah yang hilang di Andes tempat hidup ayam kotak yang dipelihara oleh suku bertubuh kotak!*

(*Kisah Hidup Paman Gober p.77*)

According to www.ancient.eu, *Cuzco* was the religious and administrative capital of the Inca Empire which flourished in ancient Peru between 1400 and 1534 CE. The translator omitted the term is that probably in the comic the expressions from the characters are limited by a speech balloon and the translator decided to omit it as the main idea of what the character said is not entirely changed.

## CONCLUSIONS AND SUGGESTIONS

### Conclusions

Based on the findings and discussions of this research, there are three conclusions related

to the formulation of the problems and the objectives of the research. There are four kinds of CSTs based on Nedergaard-Larsen are identified in Don Rosa's *The Life and Times of Scrooge McDuck*. They are geography, history, society, and culture categories. The highest frequency of CSTs are in the geography category with 138 occurrences out of 270 CSTs or 51.11% of the total data. The second highest frequency of CSTs are in the society category with 74 occurrences out of 270 CSTs or 27.41% of the total data. The third highest frequency of CSTs are in the history category with 40 occurrences out of 270 CSTs or 14.81% of the total data. The CSTs in the culture category are 18 out of 270 CSTs or 6.67% of the total data. The translator used both the foreignization and domestication translation strategies to translate the CSTs into the target language text. The findings show that the foreignization strategy is the most frequently used by the translator (155 times out of 270 CSTs or 62.59% of the data), the domestication strategy (92 times out of 270 CSTs or 34.07% of the data), and the mixed strategy (23 times out of 270 CSTs or 10.74% of the data). It can be said that the CSTs of Don Rosa's *The Life and Times of Scrooge McDuck* in *Kisah Hidup Paman Gober* are mostly translated by using foreignization strategy. The translator mostly uses foreignization strategy because there are a lot of culture-specific terms of names of region, town and people. There are 255 CSTs out of 270 CSTs or 94.45% of the data which are translated equivalent in meaning. Meanwhile, there are only 15 CSTs out of 270 CSTs or 5.55% of the data which are not equivalent in meaning. To conclude, most of the culture-specific terms have been equivalent in meaning.

### Suggestions

Based on the research, there are some suggestions to translators, other researchers who research CSTs, and to the students of English Literature Study Program.

For the translators, they should decide the use of the foreignization and domestication

strategies based on the target readers of the target language text. If the translators translate a comic which is for children, it is suggested that most of the CSTs are translated by using the domestication strategy to make the readers understand the meaning. If the target readers are mostly teenagers and young-adult, it is suggested that the CSTs are translated by using the foreignization and domestication strategies, which are balanced in numbers.

For other researchers, they should explore another kind of CSTs based on other experts and the translation strategy based on another expert. It is also suggested that they conduct this kind of research with other kinds of books, novels, or even comics which have different cultural background.

To the students of English Literature Study Program especially those concentrating in translation, it is suggested that they expand their resources of the data not only from novels, books, or movies, but also from any other things that contain product of translation such as comics, games, and signs.

## REFERENCES

### Printed Sources

- El-Shafey, F.2012. *Simultaneous Translation*. Benha: Benha University
- Harraka, P.K.2008. *Crime stories from the country of huopatossu and juhannusruusut Translation strategies for Finnish cultural realia in the English translations of two of Matti Yrjänä Joensuu's crime novels*.Helsinki: University of Helsinki
- Munday, J. 2008. *Introducing Translation Studies (2nd ed)*. New York: Routledge
- Rosa, D. 2009. *The Life and Times of Scrooge McDuck vol. 1*. Los Angeles: BOOM Kids!
- \_\_\_\_\_. 2010. *The Life and Times of Scrooge McDuck vol. 2*. Los Angeles: BOOM Kids!
- \_\_\_\_\_. 2010. *The Life and Times of Scrooge McDuck Companion*. Los Angeles: BOOM Kids!
- \_\_\_\_\_. 2013. *Kisah Hidup Paman Gober*. Jakarta: PT. Penerbitan Sarana Bobo

Vanderstoep, S. W and Johnston, D. D. 2009.  
*Research Methods for Everyday Life*.  
 San Fransisco: Jossey-Bass

### Electronic Sources

Alina Bradford. "Pumas, Panthers & Cougars: Facts About America's Big Cats".  
<http://www.livescience.com/27267-pumas.html>. Accessed 28 May 2017

Anonymous.  
 "Horseradish".<https://www.drugs.com/nc/horseradish.html>. Accessed 17 May 2017.

Anonymous. "Native American Cultures".  
[www.history.com/topics/native-american-history/native-american-cultures](http://www.history.com/topics/native-american-history/native-american-cultures). Accessed 28 May 2017

Anonymous. "sarsaparilla".  
<https://www.meriam-webster.com/dictionary/sarsaparilla>. Accessed 9 June 2017

Anonymous. "Whale Oil".  
[www.whalefacts.org/whale-oil/](http://www.whalefacts.org/whale-oil/). Accessed 9 June 2017

Anonymous. "Longhorn Cattle".  
<https://tshaonline.org/handbook/online/articles/atl02>. Accessed 9 June 2017

Anonymous. "The old fashioned Custard Pie the Internet Can't Stop Talking About".  
<http://getinmybelly.com/old-fashioned-custard-internet-cant-stop-talking/>. Accessed 10 June 2017

Anonymous. "Kamus Besar Bahasa Indonesia".  
<http://kbbi.web.id/macan>. Accessed 10 June 2017

Anonymous. "Cusco".  
<http://www.ancient.eu/Cuzco/>. Accessed 10 June 2017

Anonymous. "Theodore Roosevelt".  
<https://www.biography.com/people/theodore-roosevelt-9463424>. Accessed 27 June 2017

Chadel, Salman. "Sparkling Beverages".  
[www.academia.edu/5020304/Air\\_Soda\\_Minuman\\_Berkarbonasi\\_Sparkling\\_Beverages](http://www.academia.edu/5020304/Air_Soda_Minuman_Berkarbonasi_Sparkling_Beverages). Accessed 9 June 2017