

**MEANING AND SENTENCE REALIZATION VARIATIONS  
OF THE ENGLISH – BAHASA INDONESIA OF STEVE MCQUEEN’S ‘12 YEARS A SLAVE’  
MOVIE TEXTS**

By : Salindri, [lilinsalindri@gmail.com](mailto:lilinsalindri@gmail.com)  
First Consultant : Asruddin B. Tou, MA, Ph.D.  
Second Consultant : Yosa A. Al Zuhdy, S.S, M.Hum  
Yogyakarta State University

**Abstract**

*This study aimed to analyse the meaning and sentence realization in the English subtitles of a movie entitled 12 Years A Slave in its Bahasa Indonesia translation. In addition, it also analysed the types of translation techniques, namely realized and unrealized. The classifications of meaning realization into equivalence were also analysed. This is a descriptive qualitative study and thus the discussion was presented descriptively. Frequencies and percentages were used to support the data analysis and to strengthen the findings. The findings show that 98.9% or 894 English sentences in the source text are realized in the target text while 1.1% or 10 sentences are not. The realized sentences in the target text are in the forms of Fully Realized sentences (87%) and Partly Realized Sentences (13%), whereas the classification results in terms of meaning are Fully Equivalent (81.3%), Partly Equivalent (11.4%), Different Meaning (6.2%), and No Meaning or Unrealized (1.1%). It means that the overall translation of sentence realizations and meaning variations can be accepted. It can be concluded that the translator transfers the meaning of the subtitles of the movie entitled 12 Years A Slave appropriately and that the resulting translation can be accepted as good subtitles.*

*Keywords: meaning, realization, equivalence, 12 Years A Slave movie texts*

---

**Intisari**

Penelitian ini bertujuan untuk menganalisis realisasi makna dan kalimat dalam teks *subtitle* bahasa Inggris film berjudul *12 Years A Slave* dalam terjemahan bahasa Indonesianya. Selain itu, penelitian ini juga menganalisis jenis-jenis teknik penerjemahan, yaitu *realized* (terrealisasi) dan *unrealized* (tidak terealisasi). Klasifikasi realisasi makna menjadi ekuivalensi juga dianalisis. Ini adalah penelitian deskriptif kualitatif sehingga pembahasannya juga disajikan secara deskriptif. Frekuensi dan persentase digunakan untuk mendukung analisis data dan memperkuat temuan penelitian. Hasil penelitian menunjukkan bahwa 98,9% atau 894 kalimat bahasa Inggris dalam teks sumber tersebut direalisasikan dalam teks sasaran sementara 1,1% atau 10 kalimat tidak. Kalimat yang direalisasikan dalam teks sumber tersebut dalam bentuk Terealisasi Sepenuhnya (87%) dan Terealisasi Sebagian (13%), sedangkan hasil klasifikasi dalam hal makna adalah Sepenuhnya Ekuivalen (81,3%), Sebagian Ekuivalen (11,4%), Berbeda Makna (6,2%), dan Tidak Bermakna atau Tidak Terealisasi (1,1%). Artinya keseluruhan terjemahan realisasi kalimat dan variasi makna dapat diterima. Dapat disimpulkan bahwa penerjemah mentransfer makna pada teks *subtitle* film berjudul *12 Years A Slave* dengan tepat dan bahwa terjemahan yang dihasilkan dapat diterima sebagai teks *subtitle* yang baik.

Kata kunci: makna, realisasi, ekuivalensi, teks film *12 Years A Slave*

## BACKGROUND

Translation is the replacement of textual material in one language (source language/SL) by equivalent textual material in another language (target language/TL). In doing translation, translators have to understand the meaning of the source language and translate it into the target language without change the meaning (Catford, 1965: 20). To make a good translation, the translator should be able find the appropriate methods to translate certain text (SL to TL) without changing the meaning suppose the readers easily understand the meaning. In a process of translation the translator may find some problems with the language. The difference of language may cause some problems such as grammar, vocabulary, pronunciation, structure, etc.

In these recent years, the international film industry has promoted these two forms of translation, subtitles and dubbing. Subtitles are an abbreviated version of the dialogue, which is projected on the screen and dubbing itself is an alternate by synchronized soundtrack of the complete dialogue. Most cities and large town like Indonesia pretend the cinema where foreign film share regularly screened by translated the original language with subtitles. According Jay Boyar (1986), he points out that with subtitles the viewer must simultaneously take in the visual image while reading a script across the bottom of the movie frame.

The distribution format subtitles in a film translation usually presented on cinema, television, video, DVD, internet (streaming) and mobile technology. Based on those formats the DVD's is the most popular now especially in Indonesia. The reason why subtitles become popular because it's easy and fast to understand by our people and culture, people that really like everything flexible and instantly. Moreover subtitling also has positive advantages, people preserves the flavour and originality of the original sound, dialogues and characterizations

that is why a lot of film translated into their mother tongue.

This research is designed to analyze meaning and sentence realization variations of the English – Bahasa Indonesia '12 Years A Slave' movie texts.

## RESEARCH METHOD

This is a descriptive qualitative study. The data collected in this research are qualitative data supported by quantitative data. The qualitative data are the whole language expressions in the English and its Indonesia subtitles of a movie entitled *12 Years A Slave*. The English subtitles served as the source text while the Indonesian subtitle served as the target text. On the other hand, the quantitative data are in the form of percentages of the language expressions belonging to each realization category which the researcher shall explain in the next section.

To get and collect the data, the researcher employed some data collection instruments. In descriptive qualitative research, the key instrument for data collection and analysis is the researcher (Meriem and Tisdell, 2015). Besides, this research also used an additional instrument, namely the data sheet. In this data sheet, the data in the form of language expressions in the English movie subtitle taken from the movie CD and its Bahasa Indonesia subtitle retrieved from the Internet were rewritten in a table in the data sheet. In addition, the data sheet also contains realization and meaning classifications of the data. After all the data were distributed to their respective category, the final result of each category was indicated in percentages (%).

To ensure trustworthiness of the research findings, the researcher employ four criteria proposed by Lincoln and Guba (1985) in O'Donoghue (2015), namely *credibility*, *transferability*, *dependability*, and *conformability*. However, this research only

used three of them, which were *credibility*, *dependability*, and *conformability*.

## FINDINGS AND DISCUSSION

### 1. The Meaning and Sentence Realization Variations of the English – Bahasa Indonesia of Steve McQueen’s ‘12 Years A Slave’ Movie Texts in Realization Terms

Fully realized sentences are divided into two parts: realized (if there is a realization of the sentence in the TT) and unrealized (if there is no realization). The analysis of the ‘12 Years A Slave’ movie subtitles conducted by the researcher reveals that there are 907 fully realized sentences in the movie subtitles.

Table 1. The Meaning and Sentence Realization Variations of the English – Bahasa Indonesia of Steve McQueen’s ‘12 Years A Slave’ Movie Texts in Realization Terms

No	Sentence Realization	Total	%
1.	Realized Sentences	894	98.9%
2.	Unrealized Sentences	10	1.1%
Total		904	100%

The table shows that fully realized sentences are the sentences with the highest number (98.9%). It means that the ST sentences are realized into the TT.

#### a. Realized Sentences

Based on Table 1, from 904 sentences, 894 sentences (98,9%) are realized into TT, either fully or partly. The examples are discussed below:

##### 1) Fully Realized Sentences

###### a) Datum 11

ST : *Give me a kiss.*

TT : *Beri ayah ciuman.*

In Datum 11, the Subject and Predicate elements are clearly identified in both sentences. Each sentence has a S + V + O form in the TT, it can be concluded that the ST

(English text) is realized into the TT (Indonesian text). Here, the translator translated “me” into “ayah” because the picture on the movie showed the dialogue between a father and his son. The translator tried to minimize the written meaning by leading the readers to use their feelings to understand this movie.

##### 2) Partly Realized Sentences

###### a) Datum 13

ST : *I love you too, Dad.*

TT : *Aku juga, ayah.*

###### b) Datum 69

ST : *Well, my boy, how yah feel now?*

TT : *Baiklah, nak. Bagaimana perasaanmu?*

From the above examples, the translator did not translate all the sentence elements. Rather, the translator only translated some of the sentence elements. In this case, those sentences can be said as *partly realized*.

##### b. Unrealized Sentence

Sentence elimination (unrealized) often occurs due to time and space limitation in running text movie subtitles. Based on Table 1, from 904 sentences, 10 sentences (1.1%) are not realized. The examples are discussed below:

##### 1) Datum 541

ST : *There'll be none for you, Patsey.*

TT : -----

The dialogue above happens at midnight, dancing and drunken Mr. Epps was there looking at Patsey passionately. At the same time, their mistress brought cookies and all the slavers ate those cookies, except Patsey. From the beginning, the mistress showed her jealousy and hatred to Patsey. That is why the translator did not make translation or omission into this sentence because it can be explained by the situation and expression shown during the movie. Another example of unrealized sentences is provided below.

##### 2) Datum 592

ST : *Your prices don't reflect your concern.*

TT : -----

## 2. The Meaning and Sentence Realization Variations of the English – Bahasa Indonesia of Steve McQueen’s ‘12 Years A Slave’ Movie Texts in Terms of Fully or Partly/Incomplete Sentences

The analysis results of the ‘12 Years A Slave’ movie subtitles relating to these fully or partly/incomplete sentences are presented below.

Table 2. The Meaning and Sentence Realization Variations of the English – Bahasa Indonesia of Steve McQueen’s ‘12 Years A Slave’ Movie Texts in Terms of Fully or Partly/Incomplete Sentences

No	Sentence Realizations	Total	%
1.	Fully Realized Sentences	778	87%
2.	Partly Realized Sentences	116	13%
Total		894	100%

### a. Fully Realized Sentences

To get the best translation result, the translation must be translated in full or complete meaning which can be achieved if the meaning of ST is completely transferred into TT. Table 2 shows that from a total of 894 sentences (fully realized and partly realized) in TT, 778 sentences (87%) are fully realized. Below are some examples

#### 1) Datum 19

ST : *I wonder what you'll do without me?*

TT : *Aku penasaran apa yang akan kau lakukan tanpa aku?*

#### 2) Datum 20

ST : *I won't stay idle.*

TT : *Aku takan bermalas-malasan.*

We can see that those dialogues are translated into fully equivalent sentences or fully realized sentences as they achieve complete meaning.

### b. Partly Realized Sentences

In some condition, the complete meaning of translation is hard to achieve. That is why some of them are translated in partially equivalent sentences. It is because of the addition or omission of the information carried by the translation expressions in the target language text. From the data above, there is a total of 116 partly expressed sentences (13%). Here are some examples.

#### 1) Datum 146

ST : *Unless you want to be a dead nigger.*

TT : *Kecuali jika kau ingin mati.*

The clause is partly realized because there is one element which is not translated, namely the word “nigger”. It might be because in Indonesian culture, mentioning one’s ethnics is considered offensive and thus the translator omitted the word ‘nigger’. Some other examples are given below.

#### 2) Datum 731

ST : *It is a fact, a plain and simple fact that what is true and right*

TT : *Itulah faktanya. faktanya jelas, mana yang benar.*

#### 3) Datum 838

ST : *I would beg that you write my friends in the north, acquainting them with my situation.*

TT : *Aku akan memohon agar anda menulis surat pada temanku di utara.*

## 3. The Classification of the Sentence Realization and Variations in the Bahasa Indonesia of Steve McQueen’s ‘12 Years A Slave’ Movie Texts in Terms of Meaning

In general, meaning has priority over form in translation. According to Halliday (1985: 53), there are three kinds of meaning, namely: ideational, interpersonal, and textual meaning. In this research, the researcher focused on the ideational meaning that refers to a certain thing, event, attribution, or relation

which a person can perceive or imagine. The data of this research are in the form of simultaneous translation, so the researcher used the terms of fully equivalent (the meaning of a given expression in the ST is regarded as being fully equivalent to the meaning of a given expression in the TT), partly equivalent (sentences in the ST which meanings are not completely the same as the meaning in their realization in the TT), different meaning (the meaning of the sentences in the ST is not completely the same as the meaning in their realization in the TT), and no meaning (if there is no realization in the TT of a sentence in the ST).

Table 3. **The Classification of the Sentence Realization and Variations in the Bahasa Indonesia of Steve McQueen’s ‘12 Years A Slave’ Movie Texts in Terms of Meaning**

No	Meaning Realizations	Total	%
1.	Fully Equivalent Meaning	735	81.3%
2.	Partly Equivalent Meaning	103	11.4%
3.	Different Meaning	56	6.2%
4.	No Meaning (Unrealized)	10	1.1%
Total		904	100%

We can see from Table 4 above that from 904 sentences of sentence realization in the ST, 735 sentences of them (81.3%) have fully equivalent meaning, 103 sentences (11.4%) have partly equivalent meaning, 56 sentences (6.2%) have different meaning, and 10 sentences (1.1%) have no meaning or unrealized.

**a. Fully Equivalent Meaning**

Fully equivalent meaning means that the expression in ST has the same information content with the expression in TT. Below are some examples.

**1) Datum 6**

ST : *Throw it on the pile for replanting again.*

TT : *Taruh di atas tumpukan untuk ditanam lagi.*

**2) Datum 74**

ST : *Yah ain't a free man.*

TT : *Kau bukan orang bebas.*

The translator translated the Subject and Predicate elements in both sentences. Each sentence has a “S + V + O” form and thus, it can be concluded that the ST (English text) is realized into the TT (Indonesian text). In this case, the translator did not translate the sentence literally. The translator made accurate meaning and the meaning of the ST expression is fully transferred into the TT expression.

**3) Datum 100**

ST : *We need a sympathetic ear.*

TT : *Kita harus saling menolong.*

In this case, the translator translated the phrase idiomatically. The word “sympathetic ear” is an idiom, the translator made an accurate meaning and the meaning of the ST expression is fully transferred into the TT. Based on dictionary, the meaning of “*sympathetic ear*” is someone who is willing to listen to someone else's problems. In other words, it refers to a good listener. Since the idiom itself is the unpredictable meaning, the translator tried to translate it idiomatically. The dialogue above occurred when a little Nigger slave cried asking where his mother was and Mr. Northup tried soothing the little boy. That is why the translator defined the phrase “a good listener” (which should be “*pendengar yang baik*”) into “*saling menolong*” (help each other).

**b. Partly Equivalent Meaning**

If the information content of the expression in the TT is not completely equivalent to the information content in the ST, this is called *partly equivalent meaning*. The findings also show that 67 sentences (7.4%) sentences have partly equivalent meaning. Based on the observation, it happens because the translator did omission or deletion of the sentence elements.

**1) Datum 1**

ST : *Alright now! You all fresh niggers, You all gonna be in the cutting game.*

TT : *Baiklah! Para negro, Kalian semua ditugaskan memotong.*

The translator did a lot of deletion on the above sentence, he/she did not do literal translation. For example the words “now” and “game”, the translator did not translate them. It will be equivalent in meaning if the realization is “*Baiklah! Sekarang kalian para negro, kalian semua akan ditugaskan sebagai tukang pangkas.*” Below are the other examples.

**2) Datum 13**

ST : *I love you too, Dad.*

TT : *Aku juga, ayah.*

**3) Datum 31**

ST : *Mr. Moon is being overly gracious.*

TT : *Tn. Moon terlalu berlebihan.*

**c. Different Meaning**

There are 56 sentences (6.2%) which fall into the category of different meaning. Different meaning occurs when all or most of the information content in the ST expression is represented by words that have different meaning in the TT. Here are the examples.

**1) Datum 327**

ST : *Oh ... my ... You are a brute.*

TT : *Oh.. beraninya kau.*

**2) Datum 440**

ST : *Pick it up, Platt. Play that thing, boy!*

TT : *Mainkan, Platt. Mainkan alat itu!*

**3) Datum 487**

ST : *I meant no disrespect.*

TT : *Maksudku tak terhormat.*

**d. No Meaning (Unrealized)**

The last category, which is, no meaning or unrealized occurs when all of the information found in the ST is not found in the TT and vice versa. From the data above, there are 10 sentences (1.1%) in the category of no meaning or unrealized. The translator has her/his own reasons of why he/she did it.

**1) Datum 541**

ST : *There'll be none for you, Patsey.*

TT : ----

The dialogue above happened at midnight. The dancing and drunken Mr. Epps was there looking at Patsey passionately. At the same time, their mistress brought cookies and all the slavers ate the cookies, except Patsey. From the beginning, the mistress had shown her jealousy and dislike to Patsey and that is why the translator did not make translation or omitted this sentence because it can be explained by the situation and expression shown during the movie.

**2) Datum 573**

ST : *How can you not know?*

TT : ----

**3) Datum 750**

ST : *What you standing there for?*

TT : ----

Because there is no realization, the meaning of both sentences is not equivalent too. According to Delabattista (in Larsen, 1993: 213),

Movie-viewers will deal simultaneously with four types of sign; verbal acoustic sign (dialogue), non-verbal acoustic signs (music, sound effect), verbal visual signs (written signs in the image), and non-verbal visual signs (what is otherwise seen in the image). Since the two types of signs are dependent on hearing, subtitles have little effect on the interpretation process.

**CONCLUSION**

Based on the foregoing, the following conclusions can be drawn:

1. Regarding the meaning and sentence realization variations of the English – Bahasa Indonesia ‘12 Years A Slave’ movie texts in realization terms, it can be identified that the translation techniques are divided into two types; realized and unrealized. There are 897 sentences (99.2%) realized into TT (*Bahasa Indonesia* movie text) and 7 sentences (0.8%) unrealized to the TT. The unrealized sentences happen because the translator performs the omission process and in this case, the translator does fully omitted or fully sentence elimination. It is often because of delimitation of time and space in running text movie subtitle to the readers.
2. The meaning and sentence realization variations of the English – Bahasa Indonesia ‘12 Years A Slave’ movie texts of the fully expressed sentences are divided into two parts, they are fully expressed sentences (837 sentences or 93.3%) and partly expressed sentences (60 sentences or 6.7%).
3. The meaning expression of the target text that represents the realization of fully expressed sentences in meaning and sentence realization variations of the English – Bahasa Indonesia “12 Years A Slave” movie texts are divided into four

categories: fully equivalent, partly equivalent, different meaning, and no meaning (unrealized) where the fully equivalent meaning realization reached the highest percentage. From 904 fully expressed sentences, 798 sentences (88.3%) were fully equivalent, 46 sentences (5.1%) were partly equivalent, 53 sentences (5.9%) had different meaning and 7 sentences (0.7%) had no meaning or unrealized.

## REFERENCES

- Bell, T. 1991. *Translation and Translating; Theory and Practice*. London and New York : Longman.
- Bloomfield, L. 1933. *Language*. New York, Chicago, San Fransisco, Torornto: Holt, Rinehart and Winston.
- Halliday and Hasan. 1989. *Language, Context and Text: Aspect of Language in a soivial Semiotic Respective*. Victoria: Deakin University Press.
- Karamitroglou, F. 2000. “A Proposed Set of Subtitling Standards in Europe” <http://www.Geocities.com/CollegePark/Library/7917/fotios.html>. Accessed on 4 June 2014.
- Kridalaksana, H. 1985. *Fungsi Bahasa dan Sikap Bahasa*. Flores: Nusa Indah.
- Nida, E.A and Taber, C.R. 1982. *The Theory and Practice of Translation*. Netherlands: E.J. Brill, Leiden.